

David R. Kott – N.J. Attorney ID #018131977

McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP

Four Gateway Center
100 Mulberry Street
P.O. Box 652
Newark, NJ 07101-0652
(973) 639-2056
(973) 624-7070 FAX

Kelly S. Crawford, Esq. N.J. Attorney ID #029141993

**RIKER, DANZIG, SCHERER, HYLAND
& PERRETTI, LLP**

Headquarters Plaza
One Speedwell Avenue
Morristown, NJ 07962
(973) 451-8417
(973) 538-1984

William M. Gage, Esq. (*Pro Hac Vice*)

BUTLER SNOW LLP

Renaissance at Colony Park, Suite 1400
1020 Highland Colony Parkway
P.O. Box 6010
Ridgeland, MS 39151-6010
(601) 985-4561
(601) 985-4500 FAX

Brian Jackson, Esq. (*Pro Hac Vice*)

BUTLER SNOW LLP

The Pinnacle at Symphony Place
150 3rd Avenue South, Suite 1600
Nashville, TN 37201
(615) 651-6716
(615) 651-6701 FAX

Attorneys for Defendants

Johnson & Johnson & Ethicon, Inc.

IN RE PHYSIOMESH LITIGATION
(Flexible Composite Mesh)

FILED

JUL 29 2019

JOHN C. PORTO, J.S.C.

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY
LAW DIVISION: ATLANTIC COUNTY
MASTER CASE NO. ATL-L-2122-18

CASE NO. 627

Civil Action

AMENDED CASE MANAGEMENT

ORDER NO. 10

**[DISCOVERY, SCHEDULING AND CASE
MANAGEMENT — INITIAL
DISCOVERY POOL]**

This matter having been opened to The Court at a Case Management Conference held on July 18, 2019; in the presence of the attorneys for the Plaintiffs and the attorneys for the Defendants; and good cause appearing;

IT IS on this ^{29th} day of July, 2019,

ORDERED:

1. Amendments and joinder.

- a. Except as may be further ordered by the Court, all motions for leave to amend a complaint or to join additional parties shall be filed by Plaintiffs no later than 60 days after the Court's selection of such case to be within the "Initial Discovery Pool" as described below.

2. General discovery rules.

- a. *Applicability of rules.* Except as otherwise provided by this Court's Case Management Orders, the Rules governing the Courts of the State of New Jersey in this MCL.
- b. In accordance with the Supreme Court of New Jersey's July 17, 2018 creating this MCL, the Court will determine at a later time if any cases should be transferred for trial to a county where venue would be proper.

3. Selection of Cases for Individual Discovery:

- a. On October 1, 2019, 18 cases shall be selected for individual discovery ("Initial Discovery Pool") in the following manner:
 - i. The Court shall randomly select 10 cases;
 - ii. The Plaintiffs shall select 4 cases; and
 - iii. The Defendants shall select 4 cases.

Other than provision of Plaintiff Profile Forms, the cases selected for the Initial Discovery Pool shall be the only cases that move forward with case-specific discovery, except upon further Order of the Court.

- b. Plaintiffs will provide a completed Plaintiff Fact Sheet on each of the cases in the Initial Discovery Pool by December 2, 2019. Defendants will provide a completed Defendant Fact Sheet on each of the cases in the Initial Discovery Pool by February 3, 2020.
- c. Sales Representative documents shall be produced no later than March 16, 2020.
- d. Fact discovery on the cases in the Discovery Pool may begin immediately after the deadline for service of the Plaintiff Fact Sheets. Depositions of implanting and explanting physicians may be scheduled beginning March 16, 2020, or as otherwise agreed by the parties.
- e. The parties are directed to work together to schedule the appropriate case-specific depositions. Plaintiffs shall have the first responsibility for scheduling treating physician's depositions that are desired by either party. If Plaintiffs have not obtained a date for a physician deposition within 21 days of a request by Defendants, then a non-lawyer from a law firm representing Defendants may contact the physician's office or scheduling assistant for the purpose of scheduling the deposition.
- f. For the Initial Discovery Pool, the parties shall be limited to a maximum of five case-specific depositions per case of deponents who fit the following criteria:
 - i. The physician(s) who implanted the Ethicon mesh device(s) that are subject to the claims pending in this Court;

- ii. The physician(s) who performed a revision and/or removal surgery of the Ethicon mesh device(s) that are subject to the claims pending in this Court;
 - iii. If there are no physician(s) who fit the criteria in ii. above, then up to, but no more, than two physician(s) who have treated the Plaintiff for his/her alleged injuries; and
 - iv. The Plaintiff and Consortium Plaintiff, if applicable.
- g. The parties anticipate that these limits are sufficient, however, some cases may present specialized circumstances and, if so, if either party seeks to take additional depositions beyond those specified above, the parties shall meet and confer and if unable to agree shall apply to the Court for permission for the additional depositions. In applying to the Court, the party applying for more depositions shall set forth with particularity why the depositions listed above do not provide sufficient discovery as to why or why not the case is an appropriate trial pool case.
- h. The parties shall complete case-specific depositions by June 30, 2020 and proceed to selection of Trial Pool Cases.
4. Selection of Trial Pool Cases and Trial Cases from Initial Discovery Pool.
- a. On July 15, 2020, the Plaintiffs will choose 2 cases, the Defendants will choose 2 cases, and the Court will choose 2 cases, which will proceed with expert discovery (“Trial Pool Cases”).
 - b. Additional Depositions for Trial Pool: For each Trial Pool Case, each party may conduct such additional depositions as may be necessary. All such additional

discovery must be completed by November 2, 2020. The parties may also serve non-duplicative written discovery in the trial pool cases.

- c. Expert Disclosures: For each Trial Pool case, Plaintiffs' expert disclosures and reports shall be served by September 15, 2020. Defendants' expert disclosures and reports shall be served by December 15, 2020. Rebuttal and/or supplemental reports by Plaintiffs' experts shall be served by January 6, 2021. The parties will meet and confer with respect to the scheduling of expert depositions and depositions of experts will commence as of January 11, 2021. All expert depositions for the Trial Pool Cases shall be completed by March 15, 2021.
- d. By March 22, 2021, each side shall submit to the Court, outside of the electronic filing system, a memorandum in support of their proposed manner of trial, order of selection of plaintiffs for the initial trials, and timing of trial(s). For clerical and tracking purposes, each party shall simultaneously e-file a document under "general correspondence" alerting the clerk and administrative personnel that said trial memorandum has been filed. By March 30, 2021, the parties may submit a response to the opposing party's memorandum regarding the proposed manner of trial and order of cases for trial, and timing of trial(s).
- e. Motions: Any dispositive motions in the Trial Pool Cases shall be filed by April 15, 2021. Responses shall be filed by May 3, 2021. Replies shall be filed by May 11, 2021.
- f. General Evidentiary Motions. For the filing of evidentiary motions relating to general expert opinions (non-case-specific opinions), the parties are instructed to file only one motion per expert in the main MCL docket instead of the individual member case docket. Case-specific motions (addressing opinions applicable to

only an individual Trial Case) should be filed only in the individual Trial Case. To the extent the same expert offers both general and case-specific opinions, the parties are directed to file any motion addressing the general opinions in the main MCL and any motion addressing the case-specific opinions in the appropriate Trial Cases.

- g. The Court will set the first trial for July 2021 and will set further trials thereafter. The Court will schedule a pre-trial conference for purpose of trial at an appropriate time. Deadlines for filing motions *in limine* in the Trial Cases will be established at a later date.
- h. If Plaintiffs voluntarily dismiss a Discovery Pool Case for reasons other than settlement of the case, a replacement case will be selected in the same manner that the dismissed case was selected pursuant to paragraph 3a above. If Plaintiffs dismiss a Trial Pool Case for reasons other than settlement after it has been set for trial, the Defendants shall have the right to select a replacement case to be tried on the same date from the Trial Pool.
- i. Regarding depositions of Defendants' general experts, the Plaintiffs' Executive Committee shall designate who will question the witness on their "general" opinions.

- j. The parties should coordinate the depositions of expert witnesses to the extent there is overlap in the use of experts in multiple Trial Pool Cases. Insofar as either party utilizes or relies on the same general (non-case-specific) expert or experts in multiple cases, those experts shall be deposed only once with respect to their general opinions, unless the expert has offered additional general opinions beyond the expert's initial expert report.



HONORABLE JOHN C. PORTO, J.S.C.